

Planning Committee Report	
Planning Ref:	FUL/2018/2655
Site:	Cathedral Lanes, Broadgate
Ward:	St Michaels
Proposal:	Redevelopment of Trinity Square comprising of the removal and re-location of the Coventry Cross, the redesign of the public space area and reconfiguration of the existing rear terrace to facilitate a larger seating area in connection with the existing restaurant.
Case Officer:	Liam D'Onofrio

SUMMARY

Planning permission is sought for the removal and relocation of the Coventry Cross structure and the reconfiguration of the public space area and existing rear restaurant terrace to facilitate a larger seating area in connection with the existing restaurant/Slug and Lettuce PH. The scheme includes the creation of new retaining walls, creation of a timber canopy, removal of an existing access ramp and installation of a platform lift.

BACKGROUND

This application was originally submitted for the works to the terrace only and a separate application FUL/2018/0340 sought to deal with the removal of the Coventry Cross structure. FUL/2018/0340 provided no details for the future relocation of the Cross and has since been withdrawn. This application has subsequently been re-validated to include the removal and relocation of the cross into the scheme to ensure that a comprehensive approach is taken to the whole development.

KEY FACTS

Reason for report to committee:	Representations/petition from more than five properties.
Current use of site:	Existing restaurant terrace area and public open space containing the Coventry Cross public art structure.
Proposed use of site:	Reconfigured and enhanced restaurant terrace and public open space.

RECOMMENDATION

Planning committee are recommended to grant planning permission subject to conditions listed within the report.

REASON FOR DECISION

- The proposal is acceptable in principle.
- The proposal will not adversely impact upon the character or setting of the conservation area/surrounding listed buildings.
- The proposal will not adversely impact upon highway safety.
- The proposal will not adversely impact upon the amenity of neighbours.
- The proposal makes provision for necessary developer contributions.
- The proposal accords with Policies: DE1, HE2, R2, AC4, JE6 of the Coventry Local Plan 2016, together with the aims of the NPPF 2018.

BACKGROUND

APPLICATION PROPOSAL

Planning permission is sought for the redevelopment of Trinity Square, which comprises the redesign of the public space area, the reconfiguration of the existing rear terrace to facilitate a larger seating area in connection with the existing restaurant/Slug and Lettuce PH. To facilitate these works the scheme includes the removal and re-location of the Coventry Cross structure to a new site on Ironmonger Row.

The supporting information states that as part of current refurbishment of Cathedral Lanes the applicant also seeks to redevelop Trinity Square which currently accommodates public realm and a raised private external terrace. The current proposal includes the following:

- Reconfiguration of the existing rear terrace within Trinity Square (known as 'the plaza').
- Removal and relocation of the Coventry Cross sculpture, including ancillary lights.
- Re-design of the upper and lower dining terrace to accommodate a larger seating area in connection with the existing restaurant/Slug and Lettuce PH.
- New canopy with the installation of an external timber screen.
- An accessible lift to provide level access to the raised terrace area and restaurant.
- Planting and new railings.
- Removal of the outer wall and railings to access ramp along Trinity Churchyard.
- Improved pedestrian route to enhance connectivity and access around Cathedral Lanes.

The Supporting information states that the proposed design is considered to be a positive contribution to part of the Phase 2 works which are currently underway at Cathedral Lanes. The proposed design will improve and enhance the existing public space by creating a more well-connected upper and lower terrace for the use of the restaurant unit. This shall provide the restaurant unit with a larger seating area to support the function of the A3 (restaurant) use in the long-term. In terms of seeking high-quality design, the proposed materials comprise: Red sandstone ashier cladding, reconstituted stone coping, mild black steel railings, flamed granite stair tread and riser, timber screen, flagstone paving, natural key-block paving; and metal cladding. Materials have been designed to work in context with the existing materials of Cathedral Lanes.

The applicant seeks to mitigate the loss of the existing access ramp by installing an accessible platform lift to enhance to ease of movement for all users. The proposal will also create clear walking routes through the site to help encourage pedestrian movement and to provide a well-connected public realm.

The Coventry Cross sculpture is a replica sculpture of the medieval market cross, which is currently located within Trinity Square. The scheme includes the City Council's own proposals to carefully dismantle the existing structure which will be taken away for appropriate cleaning, and then relocated closer to the original medieval Cross location. The new location for Coventry Cross will be at the southern end of Cross Cheaping and is anticipated to become a new focal point for the sculpture and also enhance the Ironmonger Row area of the city centre.

The removal/relocation of the Cross has been incorporated into this current application following the withdrawal of the application FUL/2018/0340, which sought to remove the Cross but provided no detail to secure its relocation.

SITE DESCRIPTION

The application site is within the Cathedrals and Cultural area at the heart of the city centre and Hill Top Conservation Area, which contains many of the city's most significant historic

buildings. The site also falls within the Primary Shopping Centre of the city centre forming part of the Cathedral Lanes Shopping Centre.

The application site relates to the existing restaurant terrace serving the rear of Cathedral Lanes and the side of the Slug and Lettuce and also public open space located to the rear of the Cathedral Lanes located west of Cuckoo Lane and south of Trinity Churchyard. The rear terrace and public open space is read within the context of the Hill Top Conservation Area. Holy Trinity Church (Grade I listed) is located to the north of the site, County Hall (Grade II* listed) is located to the south and both St Michaels Cathedral and Cathedral ruins (Grade I listed) are located on the opposite side of Cuckoo Lane to the east.

A second application site is proposed for the relocated Coventry Cross, which will be located on the western side of Ironmonger Row at the southern end of Cross Cheaping, also within the city centre's Cathedrals and Cultural area. This location is close to the original location of the Coventry Cross.

PLANNING HISTORY

There have been a number of historic planning applications related to Cathedral Lanes Shopping Centre; the following are the most recent/relevant:

Application Number	Description of Development	Decision and Date
FUL/2018/0340	Removal of the Coventry Cross Sculpture including the base	Withdrawn 24/10/18
FUL/2018/2396	Installation of an entrance gate on the Broadgate entrance, including changes associated with Unit 04 shop front glazing and external access core	Granted 15/10/18
S73/2017/1475	Variation of condition 14 (list of approved documents to allow the flexible use of unit 4 for either an A3 (restaurant/cafe) or A4 (drinking establishment) use or a mixed A3/A4 use)) imposed on planning permission FUL/2016/3071 granted on 05/05/2017 for 'Internal reconfiguration of part of existing Cathedral Lanes Shopping Centre for use as 6 restaurants (Class A3), gym (Class D2), reconfigured retail store (Class A1); External alterations including two storey extension to create a further new restaurant (Class A3) to servicing yard on Pepper Lane, new shop fronts, glazing, creation of recessed balcony areas at first floor level to Broadgate, and other façade alterations; Use of the public highway at ground floor level to Broadgate as an outdoor eating/drinking area associated with the proposed restaurant units'	Granted 06/09/17

FUL/2016/3071	Internal reconfiguration of part of existing Cathedral Lanes Shopping Centre for use as 6 restaurants (Class A3), gym (Class D2), reconfigured retail store (Class A1); External alterations including two storey extension to create a further new restaurant (Class A3) to servicing yard on Pepper Lane, new shop fronts, glazing, creation of recessed balcony areas at first floor level to Broadgate, and other façade alterations; Use of the public highway at ground floor level to Broadgate as an outdoor eating/drinking area associated with the proposed restaurant units	Granted 05/05/17
L/1992/0625	New stepped entrance to existing raised terraced area adjacent to Coventry Cross	Granted 04/06/1992
C/39543/A	Redevelopment of land for 42 shops units including restaurant, 12 residential flats, offices, electricity substation and associated road works/landscaping	Granted 19/08/1987

POLICY

National Policy Guidance

National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) 2018 sets out the Government's planning policies for England and how these are expected to be applied. The NPPF promotes sustainable development and good design is recognised as a key aspect of this.

The National Planning Practice Guidance (NPPG) 2014, this adds further context to the NPPF and it is intended that the two documents are read together.

Local Policy Guidance

The current local policy is provided within the Coventry Local Plan 2016, which was adopted by Coventry City Council on 6th December 2017. Relevant policy relating to this application is:

Policy DS3: Sustainable Development Policy

Policy R1: Delivering Retail Growth

Policy R2: Coventry City Centre – Development Strategy

Policy JE6: Tourism/Visitor Related Development

Policy DE1 Ensuring High Quality Design

Policy HE2: Conservation and Heritage Assets

Policy AC1: Accessible Transport Network

Policy AC4: Walking and Cycling

City Centre Area Action Plan 2017 (CCAAP)

Policy CC1: Coventry City Centre – Development Strategy

Policy CC2: Enhancement of Heritage Assets

Policy CC4: Public Art

Policy CC6: Public Realm

Policy CC11: Accessibility

Policy CC13: Cathedral and cultural area

Policy CC18: The Primary Shopping Area

Supplementary Planning Guidance/ Documents (SPG/ SPD):

SPD Delivering a More Sustainable City

Hill Top Conservation Area Character Appraisal and Management Plan

CONSULTATION

No Objections received from:

- Environmental Protection
- Highways
- Urban Design

No objections subject to conditions have been received from:

- Conservation
- Archaeology

At the time of writing the report comments have not been received from:

- Historic England
- 20th Century Society

Immediate neighbours and local councillors have been notified; a site notice was posted on 25/10/18. A press notice was displayed in the Coventry Telegraph on 25/10/18.

Six letters of objection have been received, raising the following material planning considerations:

- a) The proposal will do demonstrable harm to the Conservation Area and no justification/heritage statement for doing this is provided.
- b) The Cathedral Quarter does not need another coffee shop or extension.
- c) Fear that relocation of the Cross will not be realised.
- d) Disabled access should not be one small outdoor lift, putting user on parade and prone to breaking/vandalism. Existing ramp will be lost.

A petition has been received sponsored by Councillor Lakha, which has 38 signatures objecting to the re-positioning of the Cross (not all of the 157 signatures could be accepted by Committee Services as they did not have an associated address and were signed on blank paper). The petition states that the signatures represent the citizens of Coventry who wish the Cross to remain in its present position and within the current setting of similar historic buildings. It is considered to move the Cross out of this environment would be detrimental to the appearance of the area and the repositioning by Primark/Greggs is deemed totally unsuitable for such a landmark.

Within the letters received the following non-material planning considerations were raised, these cannot be given due consideration in the planning process:

- e) Objection due to the cost.
- f) The restaurant should move if they want bigger premises.

One letter of support has been received from the Dean of Coventry providing the following comments:

- g) The Cathedral has no objection to the relocation of the cross. The argument for opening up access and views around the interface between Holy Trinity Church, Cuckoo Lane and the Cathedral Ruins is understood and supported. The Cathedral believe that the

removal of the cross from its present position could bring a positive benefit to the environment in the Hill Top area.

- h) It is important to maintain public awareness of Coventry's history, so the refurbishment and relocation of the Cross is also supported to a more suitable site, especially if it can act as a signpost to the historically significant Cathedral Quarter.

Any further comments received will be reported within late representations.

APPRAISAL

The main issues in determining this application are the principle of development, the impact upon the character of the area and heritage assets, the impact upon neighbouring amenity and highway considerations.

Principle of development

Policy R2 'Coventry City Centre – Development Strategy' states that the city centre will continue to be developed and regenerated to ensure it is a truly world class city centre, leading in design, sustainability and culture. This will be achieved by, amongst other things: enhancement of its retail and leisure offer to strengthen the city's sub-regional role; including a variety of places to live which cater for different needs; preserving or enhancing the character and setting of the historic built landscape and the archaeological environment; a connected public realm including public squares and green spaces, easily accessible through the creation of desirable and legible pedestrian routes; accessible for all; providing an attractive and safe environment for pedestrians, cyclists and motorists; high quality sustainable built design; continuing to develop a vibrant and attractive night time economy; providing opportunities to improve health and wellbeing; and preserving key views to the iconic three spires of St Michaels, Holy Trinity and Christchurch. The CCAAP Policy CC1 sets out a development strategy for the city centre reflecting the aims of Policy R2 above

CCAAP Policy CC21 'Cathedral Lanes' specifically deals with the site and states that Cathedral Lanes will continue to be promoted for a change of use to café and restaurant uses, with such uses encouraged to spill out onto Broadgate Square to help reflect the new public realm. Opportunities should also be taken to enhance the façade of the building and create a new link through the building in order to improve the connectivity from Broadgate/Upper Precinct to Coventry Cathedral and the Hill Top Conservation Area.

Policy JE6 'Tourism/Visitor Related Development' states that proposals for development within Coventry City Centre, which would contribute towards the city's role as a tourist destination will be supported subject to compatibility with other Plan Policies.

The NPPF 2018 seeks to promote a strong competitive economy and to ensure the vitality of town centres.

The scheme proposes the positive regeneration and enhancement of the rear terraces of Cathedral Lanes and the adjoining public realm providing both physical and economic benefits. The investment and improvements are highly desirable and will assist in securing more sympathetic design solution than present, lowering existing boundary walls and removing pillars and railings to create better interaction with the streetscene and a more welcoming outside restaurant space that will provide a vibrant and attractive space in accordance with the CCAAP and Policy R2.

The scheme will also find a new, more visually prominent home for the Coventry Cross sculpture in Ironmonger Row closer to the siting of the original medieval Cross of which the

current structure is a replica. It is evident from the public response that there are sensitivities around the relocation of the Cross, which is required to facilitate this scheme.

It is noted that these proposals form part of the bigger redevelopment of Cathedral Lanes as a restaurant quarter. Works are progressing and the redevelopment has been extremely successful thus far, attracting nationally recognised restaurants to the city generating significant footfall into the city, economic investment and spend, and consumer choice, which are all public benefits for the citizens of Coventry.

The scheme is considered to be acceptable in principle. The removal and relocation of the cross is considered in greater detail below.

Heritage character of the area and Heritage Assets

Policy context

Section 72 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) 1990 imposes a duty when exercising planning functions to pay special attention to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character of a Conservation Area. Section 66 of the same Act imposes a duty to have special regard to the desirability of preserving a listed building or its setting when considering whether to grant a planning permission which affects a listed building or its setting.

NPPF Paragraph 193 states that when considering the impact of a proposed development on the significance of a designated heritage asset, great weight should be given to the asset's conservation (and the more important the asset, the greater the weight should be). This is irrespective of whether any potential harm amounts to substantial harm, total loss or less than substantial harm to its significance.

NPPF Paragraph 196 indicates that where a development proposal will lead to less than substantial harm to the significance of a designated heritage asset, this harm should be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal including, where appropriate, securing its optimum viable use. NPPF Paragraph 197 states that the effect of an application on the significance of a non-designated heritage asset should be taken into account in determining the application. In weighing applications that directly or indirectly affect non-designated heritage assets, a balanced judgement will be required having regard to the scale of any harm or loss and the significance of the heritage asset.

Local Plan Policy HE2 reflects NPPF policy and states that development proposals involving heritage assets in general and listed buildings in particular, should acknowledge the significance of the existing building and the area by means of their siting, massing, form, scale, materials and detail.

The CCAAP Policy CC2 'Enhancement of Heritage Assets' states, amongst other things, that all development relating to or in close proximity to heritage assets such as statutory and locally listed buildings, Scheduled Monuments, public artwork and non-designated heritage assets shall be undertaken sympathetically to those heritage assets and seek to preserve or enhance their setting. Policy CC13 states that all development proposals within the Hill Top Conservation Area will only be considered acceptable if they demonstrate that they preserve and enhance the historic environment of the area and are in adherence with the policies of the respective Conservation Area Management Plans.

Assessment

The application site is a centralising space, where the built form of the medieval city can be experienced as a collective group. The Cross itself is a predominantly modern structure therefore consideration needs to be given to the impact that removing the Cross sculpture would have on the significance of the conservation area as opposed to any significance of the Cross itself.

The conservation officer considers that the general works to the seating area outside Cathedral Lanes will have a clear and beneficial impact on the conservation area. It is considered that the removal of the sculpture will inevitably leave quite a gap in a high-quality public space which draws together numerous highly significant heritage assets, most notably the Cathedral and Holy Trinity. However it is considered that public art can be incorporated within this space to ensure it continues to be provide visual interest and a public focal point. This may respond to the new and evolving contexts of the redeveloped square and the way in which it is to be used and experienced.

The conservation officer has raised no objections to the scheme, subject to securing the following conditions:

- A condition to secure a programme of public art in the space left by the Cross.
- A condition for more detail for the public realm and landscaping strategy to deal with the space following removal of the sculpture, including the materials to be used for paving etc.
- A condition for a short method statement for how the Cross will be removed, and how it and the surrounding paving materials will be protected. This should include details on the materials to be used to repair the space left by the Cross' removal.

A further condition is suggested to secure a method statement for the restoration and relocation of the Cross on Ironmonger Row.

The scheme is considered to cause 'less than substantial harm' in terms of the NPPF. The overall scheme, subject to conditions, is not therefore considered to create any significant impact upon the character and setting of the conservation area and surrounding listed buildings.

Historic England and the 20th Century Society have also been consulted, however no comments have been received at the time of writing the report. Members will be updated at Planning Committee accordingly.

Archaeology

In terms of archaeology the Conservation Officer has raised no objection to the scheme, subject to a condition to secure a programme of archaeological works.

Siting/Design

Policy DE1 of the Local Plan seeks to ensure high quality design and development proposals must respect and enhance their surroundings and positively contribute towards the local identity and character of an area.

The Terrace

The Council's Urban Design Officer has commented that the site sits on the intersection of two pedestrian routes. One of these routes runs from Broadgate through to University Square and acts as one of the key routes leading pedestrians from the City's retail core through its historic heart to the University and vice versa. The site currently detracts from the quality of this route heading both into and out of the retail centre. In both these views the site, as a composition, is visually jarring and overbearing. The ramp along Trinity Lane is

somewhat clunky, with garish red brick that tonally jars with the neighbouring sandstone and thick chunky railings that are poorly proportioned and clumsily attached to the wall. They are also a very poor pastiche of a traditional railing. Furthermore the former restaurant is in a poor state of repair and the red painted metal work again jars with its surroundings. The ramp also narrows Trinity Lane at this point and its height makes it somewhat overbearing. It adds nothing to the character of the lane and only serves to detract from the quality of the visual experience when walking along from Broadgate.

The view from St Michaels Ave is equally poor. Here the upper and lower terraces with their oppressively high brick columns in the same visually jarring red brick, poor pastiche railings, steps, ramp and brick walls with railings atop, all set at arbitrary angles, combine to create a visually jarring a cluttered focal point. The space feels claustrophobic and detracts from the setting of the adjoining historic buildings and conservation area.

By contrast the proposed scheme seeks to strip out all the visual clutter associated with the terrace and provide a more considered and pared back scheme that removes the arbitrary angles, reduces wall heights, improves connectivity with the public highway and provides sympathetic materials. The timber canopy set within the terrace is set well back from the highway within an unobtrusive position. The visually oppressive ramp to Trinity Lane is removed, considerably widening the lane at this point and the base of the restaurant building is clad in sandstone that tonally and texturally fits with its context. This combined with the refurbished restaurant itself, replacing red paint with a subtle grey painted metal work, will make for a much more positive and welcoming approach.

Paving materials will match existing, cobbles and sandstone, and a number of bollards are proposed to subtly demarcate the space not within the sandstone walls. It is proposed that these replicate some of the bollards already found within the area, however these could be designed in collaboration with an artist/sculptor to add a subtle element of interest to the space – as could the planters. Such detailing would be secured through the public art condition.

The overall effect is of a scheme that visually harmonises the space and integrates it in a far better way with its surroundings, through the pared back design of the terraces, the sympathetic use of materials.

The Cross

The Coventry Cross is a substantial structure of considerable mass and bulk, constructed from concrete with sandstone figures. It is proposed that the cross be relocated to the west side of Ironmonger Square where it transitions into Cross Cheaping, a space which currently lacks a focal point/point of interest. It is considered that the repositioning of the Cross in this location would act as a positive focal point /landmark and take on a degree of prominence that it doesn't necessarily have in its current location. Furthermore it would become a focal point on the historic route into the city centre from Bishop Street and The Burges and this would give it a strong historical connection as the original versions of the cross sat on this route in Cross Cheaping.

Both the proposed works to the terrace and the relocation of the Cross are therefore considered to be acceptable in terms of Policy DE1.

Impact on residential amenity

The scheme relates to an outdoor seating area linked to an existing restaurant with existing and established comings and goings and associated activity. Environmental Protection are

content that the proposed development will not create any additional impact upon nearby residents in terms of noise and disturbance.

The proposed physical changes to built form are not considered to result in any significant loss of light, outlook or amenity to the occupiers of surrounding properties, the closest being the residential flats within Cathedral Lanes fronting onto Trinity Churchyard.

Highway considerations

Policy AC4 states that development proposals should incorporate appropriate safe and convenient access to walking and cycling routes. The scheme will improve walking routes around the site and interconnectivity with the restaurant terrace and the rear elevation of Cathedral Lanes.

The Highway Authority have no objections to the proposed scheme.

Equality implications.

Concerns raised within the representations that replacing an access ramp with an access lift that could be prone to break downs/vandalism are noted; however the platform lift is a common access solution and can be appropriately managed by the applicant. The platform lift will take up significantly less space than the existing hard landscaped access ramp, providing overall public realm benefits.

The public building will be required to have a risk assessment that would cover people leaving the building in the event of either an emergency or the lift breaking down, including disabled exit points. This is covered under separate Building Regulations legislation.

Other matters

The scheme is not considered to raise any flood risk, contaminated land, air quality or ecology issues.

Conclusion

The proposed development is considered to be acceptable in principle and will not result in any significant impact upon the character and setting of the conservation area/heritage assets, neighbour amenity, or highway safety, subject to relevant conditions and contributions. The reason for Coventry City Council granting planning permission is because the development is in accordance with: Policies DE1, HE2, R2, JE6, AC4 of the Coventry Local Plan 2016, together with the aims of the NPPF 2018.

CONDITIONS/REASON

1. The development hereby permitted shall begin no later than three years from the date of this permission.

Reason: *To comply with Section 91 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990.*

2. The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved documents: Drg No.T(91) P101 P1, T(21)D101 P1, D102 P1, D103 P1, S101 P1, S102 P1, P101 P1, E101 P1.

Reason: *For the avoidance of doubt and in the interests of proper planning.*

3. The proposed development shall proceed in full accordance with the following details to be submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority:
- a) a construction management plan and phasing programme of works;
 - b) a method statement detailing how the Cross structure will be dismantled, how surrounding paving materials will be protected during this process, and details of the materials to be used to repair the space left by the Cross' removal;
 - c) a method statement detailing how the Cross structure will be relocated within its new position on Ironmonger Row;
 - d) details for a programme of public art within the space left by the Cross.
- All details shall be carried out as approved.

Reason: *To mitigate the impact of the development during construction, to maintain a free flow of pedestrian foot traffic and to ensure that the proposed development has a satisfactory external appearance in the interests of the visual amenities of the area in accordance with Policies DE1, HE2, AC4 and DS3 of the Coventry Local Plan 2016.*

4. The development hereby permitted shall only be undertaken in strict accordance with the approved materials details and hard landscaping works. Railings shall have been colour coated within one month of their installation. The platform access lift shall have been installed and fully operational prior to the first use of the upper terrace levels to members of the public and shall remain available for access needs thereafter.

Reason: *To ensure that the proposed development has a satisfactory external appearance in the interests of the visual amenities of the area and an appropriate access route to accommodate all users of the development in accordance with Policies DE1, HE2, AC4 and DS3 of the Coventry Local Plan 2016.*

5. No development shall take place that involves the digging of new foundations until the applicant, or their agents or successors in title, have secured the implementation of a programme of archaeological work in accordance with a written scheme of investigation which has been submitted by the applicant and approved by the Local Planning Authority. Once approved the development shall only be undertaken in accordance with those approved details (or any subsequently approved amendments). This condition does not restrict the demolition works or the removal replacement of existing hardstanding.

Reason: *To ensure that any important and irreplaceable archaeological remains are not destroyed during the construction process in accordance with Policy HE2 of the Coventry Local Plan 2016.*

